



## The use, by Einstein, of the Principle of Dimensional Homogeneity, in three problems of the Physics of Solids

**FERNANDO L. LOBO B. CARNEIRO**

Universidade Federal do Rio de Janeiro, Ciências da Engenharia, CT  
21945-970 Rio de Janeiro, RJ, Brazil

Anais da Academia Brasileira de Ciências / [www.abc.org.br/](http://www.abc.org.br/)

Vol.72 n.4 / Rio de Janeiro / Dec. 2000

<http://dx.doi.org/10.1590/S0001-37652000000400009>

[http://www.scielo.br/scielo.php?script=sci\\_arttext&pid=S0001-37652000000400009&lng=en&nrm=iso&tlng=en](http://www.scielo.br/scielo.php?script=sci_arttext&pid=S0001-37652000000400009&lng=en&nrm=iso&tlng=en)

*Manuscript received on July 14, 2000; accepted for publication on July 21, 2000.*

### ABSTRACT

Einstein, in 1911, published an article on the application of the principle of dimensional homogeneity to three problems of the physics of solids: the characteristic frequency of the atomic nets of crystalline solids as a function of their moduli of compressibility or of their melting points, and the thermal conductivity of crystalline insulators.

Recognizing that the physical dimensions of temperature are not the same as those of energy and heat, Einstein had recourse to the artifice of replace that physical parameter by its product by the Boltzmann constant, so obtaining correct results.

But nowadays, with the new basic quantities

"Thermodynamic Temperature  $\Theta$  (unit- Kelvin)",

"Electric Current  $I$  (unit Ampère)"

"Amount of Substance  $MOL$  (unit-mole)",

incorporated to the SI International System of Units, in 1960 and 1971, the same results are obtained in a more direct and coherent way.

At the time of Einstein's article only three basic physical quantities were considered :  
length  $L$ , mass  $M$ , and time  $T$ .

He ignored the P theorem of dimensional analysis diffused by Buckingham three years later, and obtained the "P numbers" by trial and error.

In the present paper is presented a revisitation of the article of Einstein, conducted by the modern methodology of dimensional analysis and theory of physical similitude.

*Observação - Ver parte do artigo de Einstein no ANEXO 01, ao final - Elementare Betrachtungen über die thermische Molekularbewegung in festen Körpern, Annalen der Physik 35,*

[http://echo.mpiwg-berlin.mpg.de/ECHODocuViewSB?url=http%3A//content.mpiwg-berlin.mpg.de/mpiwg/online/permanent/einstein/annalen/Einst\\_Elеме\\_de\\_1911/index.meta&start=1&pn=1&mode=texttool](http://echo.mpiwg-berlin.mpg.de/ECHODocuViewSB?url=http%3A//content.mpiwg-berlin.mpg.de/mpiwg/online/permanent/einstein/annalen/Einst_Elеме_de_1911/index.meta&start=1&pn=1&mode=texttool)

## INTRODUCTION

*“Aus Dimensionalbetrachtungen kann man bekanntlich zunächst allgemeine funktionelle Zusammenhänge zwischen physikalischen Grössen finden, wenn man alle physikalischen Grössen kennt, welche in dem betreffenden Zusammenhang vorkommen” (Einstein 1911).*

( "It is well known that from dimensional considerations it is possible to closely find general relationships between physical quantities when one knows all the physical quantities that participate in the referred relationship" ),

wrote Einstein in his article "*Elementare Betrachtungen über die thermische Molekularbewegung in festen Körper*" – ("Elementary considerations on the thermal agitation in solid bodies"), published in 1911, six years after his fundamental articles on the special theory of relativity, the light quanta and the Brownian motion, and one year before the theory of general relativity.

The "very close difference" between the approximate formulation of a physical relationship given by dimensional analysis and the exact one, is merely a dimensionless numerical factor that, if necessary, can be determined by experience or theoretical considerations.

According to Einstein, this factor is generally of the order of magnitude "one" i.e., smaller than 10.

He gives as an example, the determination of the period of small oscillations of the

pendulum,  $T$  is proportional to  $\left(\frac{L}{g}\right)^{1/2}$ , or  $T = C \cdot \left(\frac{L}{g}\right)^{1/2}$ , with  $C \approx 6,3$ .

The theoretical value of  $C$  is  $2\pi$ .

The Principle of Dimensional Homogeneity is a consequence of the condition that every mathematical expression which expresses a physical law or describes a physical process must be invariant in relation with any changes of the fundamental units of measure.

Its utilization by scientists has been very fecund in basic sciences like mathematics and physics, - geometry, general mechanics, mechanics of deformable solids and of fluids, thermology, electromagnetism - and even biology.

Maxwell, the creator of the symbolic dimensional formulae, was based in dimensional considerations in the electromagnetic theory of light and in the prediction of the electromagnetic waves, - later experimentally confirmed by Hertz (Maxwell 1868).

The engineering applications are also very important - like strength of materials, structural engineering, hydraulics, soil mechanics, aerodynamics (Carneiro 1996).

In the present article it is shown, by the valuable testimony of Einstein, that the applications to the physics of solids are also significant.

## 1. CHARACTERISTIC FREQUENCY OF THE ATOM OF A SOLID AS A FUNCTION OF THE COEFFICIENT OF COMPRESSIBILITY

The most simple possibility to determine, by dimensional considerations, the characteristic frequency  $\nu$  of the atom of a solid crystalline body, according to Einstein, is that the mechanism of vibration is determined by the following quantities:

- the mass  $m_a$  of the atom (dimension M),
- the distance  $d$  between two neighbour atoms (dimension L), and
- the resistance opposed by two neighbour atoms to any change of the distance between them. That resistance is measured by the coefficient of compressibility  $\chi$  valid for elastic deformations (dimension  $L T^2/M$ , the inverse of the modulus of elasticity).

So, the problem presents 4 variables: the dependent variable  $\nu$  and the independent variables  $m_a$ ,  $d$  and  $\chi$ .

Applying the principle of dimensional homogeneity Einstein obtained, probably by the trial and error method, an expression - product of powers of the independent variables, with the same dimension as the dependent one, and wrote

$$\nu = C ( d \cdot m_a^{-1} \cdot \chi^{-1} )^{1/2}$$

This is the same as to equalize to the numerical factor C, a dimensionless number, the unique  $\pi$  number of the problem.

But the independent variables  $m_a$  and  $d$  are not directly given and Einstein finally modified his formula taking the molar volume  $v_m$ , the density  $\rho$  and the atomic or molar mass  $M_a$  as known physical properties of the substance, and  $N_A$  - number of Avogadro, as physical universal constant :

$$m_a = M_a/N_a, \quad d = (v_m/N_a)^{1/3} = [(M_a/N_A) / \rho ]^{1/3}$$

The new formula is then:

$$\nu = C \cdot N_A^{1/3} \cdot M_a^{-1/3} \cdot \rho^{-1/6} \cdot \chi^{-1/2} \quad (1)$$

Einstein would obtain this formula directly, if the new basic quantity **MOL** were already incorporated to the SI System and if he employed the modern methodology of dimensional analysis, based on the  $\pi$  theorem of Vaschy-Buckingham (Carneiro 1993) and on the "dimensional matrix", whose lines correspond to the basic quantities and columns to the parameters of the problem, and whose elements are their "exponents of dimension"

	$M_a$	$\rho$	$\chi$	$N_A$	$\nu$
$L$	0	-3	1	0	0
$M$	1	1	-1	0	0
$T$	0	0	2	0	-1
<b>MOL</b>	-1	0	0	-1	0

That matrix has a rank 4 and 5 columns.

According to the  $\pi$  theorem it will be only one  $\pi$  number.

The exponents of the variables in that  $\pi$  number are easily obtainable by the multiplication of the negative of the inverse of the square matrix of the first 4 columns, by the vector of the last one (Carneiro 1996, Langhaar 1951, Brand 1957).

The unique  $\pi$  number so obtained is :

$$\pi = \nu \cdot N_A^{-1/3} \cdot M_a^{1/3} \cdot \rho^{1/6} \cdot \chi^{1/2}$$

and the solution of the problem is  $\pi = C$ .  $C$  being a numerical factor.

According to Einstein, based on previous theoretical considerations,  $C \approx 1/3$ .

## 2. RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE MELTING POINT OF SOLID BODIES AND THE CHARACTERISTIC FREQUENCY OF THE ATOMS

Referring to the "formula of Lindemann", Einstein takes the melting point as a third characteristic physical magnitude of the substance, that is so determined as the mass of a atom, the distance between two neighbour atoms and the characteristic frequency (Einstein 1911).

"The melting temperature  $\theta_s$ ", says Einstein, "is not usable in dimensional considerations, because it cannot directly be measurable in the C.G.S. System".

"Then I take instead of  $\theta_s$  the energy-magnitude  $\tau = R \cdot \theta_s / N_A$ , where  $\tau$  is one third of the energy of a atom at the melting point, according to the kinetic theory of heat,  $R$  the constant of gases, and  $N_A$  the number of atoms in a atom-gram (Avogadro)" ( $R/N_A$  is the constant of Boltzmann).

Taking the same steps as in the precedent section, with  $\tau$  instead of  $\chi$ , he obtains the formula :

$$v = C \cdot (\tau \cdot m_a^{-1} \cdot d^{-2})^{1/2}$$

and replacing :  $\tau$  by  $R \cdot \theta_s / N_A$  ;

$m_a$  by  $M_a / N_A$  ;

$d$  by  $[(M_a / N_A) / \rho]^{1/3}$

he obtains the formula :

$$v = C \cdot N_A^{1/3} \cdot \theta_s^{1/2} \cdot \rho^{1/3} \cdot M_a^{-5/6} \cdot R^{1/2} \dots\dots\dots (2)$$

Einstein did not fall into the famous error of Riabouchinsky, who insisted in his polemic against Lord Rayleigh that temperature is a magnitude with the same dimensions as heat and energy.

He used an artifice to escape from the impasse.

With the new basic magnitude "Thermodynamic Temperature" introduced in the SI System in 1960 Einstein would not need to use that ingenious artifice, and, adopting the new methodology of dimensional analysis, would write the dimensional matrix (Carneiro 1996):

	$\theta_s$	$\rho$	$M_a$	$N_A$	$R$	$\nu$
$L$	0	-3	0	0	2	0
$M$	0	1	1	0	1	0
$T$	0	0	0	0	-2	-1
$\theta$	1	0	0	0	-1	0
$MOL$	0	0	-1	-1	-1	0

From that matrix, a unique  $\pi$  number is obtained

$$\pi = \nu \cdot \theta_s^{-1/2} \cdot \rho^{-1/3} \cdot M_a^{5/6} \cdot N_A^{-1/3} \cdot R^{-1/2}$$

and the solution of the problem is  $\pi = C$ .

According to Einstein, based on the findings of Lindemann,  $C \approx 3$ .

It is possible to obtain the same formula (2), but with a different value for  $C$ , with the hypothesis that at the melting point the amplitude of the vibrations of the atoms is equal to the mean distance between them (Leite Lopes 1992).

### 3. THERMAL CONDUCTIVITY OF CRYSTALLINE INSULATORS

The third problem treated in the article of Einstein is the theoretical result obtained by Eucken that the thermal conductivity of crystalline insulators is approximately proportional to the inverse of the absolute temperature  $\theta$ , and not independent of that temperature, Einstein says that it is possible to obtain this result by one "very interesting" dimensional consideration.

But, by the same reasons of the precedent chapter, he takes, in the definition of the coefficient  $k$  of thermal conductivity, instead of  $\theta$ , the product  $\tau = R \cdot \theta / N_A$ , whose dimension is - energy.

The corresponding coefficient is designed by  $k_{\text{nat}}$  by Einstein.

But a new difficulty arises.

Instead of 3 independent variables, like in the two precedent problems, there are now 4 :  $d, m, \nu$ , and  $\tau$ , besides the dependent variable  $k_{\text{nat}}$ .

With the deficient base L M T, Einstein obtained then, by the trial and error method, two  $\pi$  numbers, and wrote

$$k_{\text{nat}} = C \cdot (d^{-1} \cdot \nu) \cdot \varphi \cdot (m \cdot d^2 \cdot \nu^2 / \tau)$$

Einstein, for obtaining the result from Eucken, formulated the hypothesis that the function  $\varphi$  would be proportional to its argument, and wrote

$$k_{\text{nat}} = C \cdot m \cdot d \cdot \nu^3 \cdot \tau^{-1}$$

from that,  $k$  proportional to  $\theta^{-1}$ .

By the new SI System the dimensional matrix is no more deficient, and the temperature can be directly included into the parameters of the problem:

	$\rho$	$M_a$	$\nu$	$N_A$	$\theta$	$k$
$L$	-3	0	0	0	0	1
$M$	1	1	0	0	0	1
$T$	0	0	-1	0	0	-3
$\theta$	0	0	0	0	1	-1
$MOL$	0	-1	0	-1	0	0

From that matrix a unique  $\pi$  number is obtained

$$\pi = k \cdot M_a^{(-4/3)} \cdot \rho^{(1/3)} \cdot \nu^{(-3)} \cdot N_A^{(1/3)} \cdot \theta$$

and the solution is  $\pi = C$ . Then  $k$  proportional to  $\theta^{-1}$ .

The results showed in this chapter cannot be applied to the case of crystalline solids, like metals, that are good conductors of electricity, but only to crystalline insulators, because the thermal conductivity is strongly related with the electrical conductivity.

### EXAMPLES OF APPLICATION OF THE FORMULAE

Substance	$M_a$	$\chi$	$\theta_s$	$\rho$	characteristic frequency	
	( $\times 10^3$ )	( $\times 10^{12}$ )			( $\times 10^{-12}$ )	
	kg	$\text{Pa}^{-1}$	$^\circ\text{K}$	$\text{kg/m}^3$	Formula (1)	Formula (2)
					( $C = 1/3$ )	( $C = 3$ )
<b>iron</b>	55.8	6.0	1808	7860	6.75	6.83
<b>aluminium</b>	27.0	14.0	931	2700	6.72	6.28
<b>copper</b>	63.6	8.0	1353	8960	5.47	5.51
<b>nickel</b>	28.0		2453	8900		12.90
<b>silver</b>	107.9		1233	10500		3.59
<b>gold</b>	197.2		1347	19310		2.79
<b>platinum</b>	195.1		2037	21400		3.37
<b>silicon</b>	28.1		1693	2420		7.90



## REFERENCES

- BRAND L. 1957. The Theorem of Dimensional Analysis, Archiv for Rational Mechanics and Analysis, Heidelberg, Deutschland, vol.1, p.35-45.
- CARNEIRO FLLB. 1993. Vaschy, Pioneer in the Formulation and Demonstration of the Theorem of Dimensional Analysis, XIX International Congress of History of Science, Book of Scientific Sections Abstracts, Grafica Olimar, Zaragoza. Spain, p/ M4-7/18.
- CARNEIRO FLLB. 1996. Análise Dimensional e Teoria da Semelhança e dos Modelos Físicos, Editora UFRJ, Rio de Janeiro, 258 p.
- EINSTEIN A. 1911. Elementare Betrachtungen über die thermische Molekularbewegung in festen Körpern, Annalen der Physik 35, Deutschland, p. 670-694.
- LANGHAAR HL. 1951. Dimensional Analysis and Theory of Models, John Willey & Sons, 166 p.
- LEITE LOPES J. 1992. A Estrutura Quântica da Matéria, Editora UFRJ., Rio de Janeiro, p.319-324.
- MAXWELL J. 1868. On a Method of Making a direct Comparison of Electrostatic and Electromagnetic Force, with a Note on the Electromagnetic Theory of Light, in Philosophical Transactions, Deutschland, C L VIII. 1868.

## ANEXO – 01

### Primeira página do artigo de Albert Einstein – 1911

[http://echo.mpiwg-berlin.mpg.de/ECHOdocuViewSB?url=http%3A//content.mpiwg-berlin.mpg.de/mpiwg/online/permanent/einstein/annalen/Einst\\_Eleme\\_de\\_1911/index.meta&start=1&pn=1&mode=texttool](http://echo.mpiwg-berlin.mpg.de/ECHOdocuViewSB?url=http%3A//content.mpiwg-berlin.mpg.de/mpiwg/online/permanent/einstein/annalen/Einst_Eleme_de_1911/index.meta&start=1&pn=1&mode=texttool)

-----

### **Elementare Betrachtungen über die thermische Molekularbewegung in festen Körpern ; von A. Einstein.**

In einer früheren Arbeit<sup>1)</sup> habe ich dargelegt, daß zwischen dem Strahlungsgesetz und dem Gesetz der spezifischen Wärme fester Körper (Abweichung vom Dulong - Petitschen Gesetz) ein Zusammenhang existieren müsse<sup>2)</sup>.

Die Untersuchungen Nernsts und seiner Schüler haben nun ergeben, daß die spezifische Wärme zwar im ganzen das aus der Strahlungstheorie gefolgerte Verhalten zeigt, daß aber das wahre Gesetz der spezifischen Wärme von dem theoretisch gefundenen systematisch abweicht.

Es ist ein erstes Ziel dieser Arbeit, zu zeigen, daß diese Abweichungen darin ihren Grund haben, daß die Schwingungen der Moleküle weit davon entfernt sind, monochromatische Schwingungen zu sein.

Die thermische Kapazität eines Atoms eines festen Körpers ist nicht gleich der eines schwach gedämpften, sondern ähnlich der eines stark gedämpften Oszillators im Strahlungsfelde.

Der Abfall der spezifischen Wärme nach Null hin bei abnehmender Temperatur erfolgt deshalb weniger rasch, als er nach der früheren Theorie erfolgen sollte; der Körper verhält sich ähnlich wie ein Gemisch von Resonatoren, deren Eigenfrequenzen über ein gewisses Gebiet verteilt sind.

Des weiteren wird gezeigt, daß sowohl Lindemanns Formel, als auch meine Formel zur Berechnung der Eigenfrequenz  $\nu$  der Atome durch **Dimensional-betrachtung** abgeleitet werden können, insbesondere auch die Größenordnung der in diesen Formeln auftretenden Zahlen.

...

...

-----

1) A. Einstein, Ann. d. Phys. 22. p. 184. 1907.

2) Die Wärmebewegung in festen Körpern wurde dabei aufgefaßt als in monochromatischen Schwingungen der Atome bestehend. Vgl. hierzu § 2 dieser Arbeit.

+ + +